



OUTLINING A COURSE ON COMPETITIVE SHAPING

ADAM ELKUS & MICHAEL P. NOONAN



FOREIGN POLICY RESEARCH INSTITUTE

Outlining a Course on Competitive Shaping

Assuming a 12-week course for advanced undergraduates and graduates, a competitive shaping course ought to focus on something resembling the following narrative. State, non-state, and quasi-state actors compete frequently in world politics. The method of competition may operate directly on the behavior of an opponent or indirectly to change the structure of the environment that influences the opponent's decision-making. The former has been well-covered in traditional theories of world politics and national security, the latter is generally not. This course focuses on the latter, lesser-included methods. Generalized questions the course asks are as follows:

1. What role does guile vs. strength play in world politics?
2. How can integrated and competitive minded strategies of the state accomplish actors' political objectives?
3. How do non-state and quasi-state actors utilize integrated strategies?
4. How should competitions be assessed?
5. What are the various theories and approaches to competitive shaping; how do they differ; and what are their advantages and disadvantages?
6. When does competitive shaping work, and when does it not?
7. How do different types of regimes vary in their usage of competitive shaping?
8. What kind of broader patterns emerge from a study of competitive shaping?
9. How does use of competitive shaping interface with other means of power?

The composition of the survey course is up to the discretion of the instructor, but it is recommended that a balance be made between the following thematic topics:

- Competition in politics (domestic, international, and world politics)
- Competitive theories, approaches, and perspectives
- Instruments, tools, and techniques on subnational, national, international, and cross-national levels
- Particular componential elements that must be considered
- Historical, comparative, and contemporary cases

Outlining a Course on Competitive Shaping

Whenever possible, students should be encouraged to select past cases for review and assessment. Student grades will be assessed by how well they identify the structure of the competition, discuss the strengths, weaknesses, and asymmetries between competitors, and analyze the nature, effects, and relationships of competitor strategies and tactics.

Students should also select current cases and present their assessment of U.S. and/or competitor opportunities, interactions, and strategies. If possible, exercises and simulations of competitive dynamics could also be employed within the classroom utilizing the model of a policy game/simulation, though it is not strictly necessary. A possible exercise could be student actors picking a target to support or counter, identify opportunities, strategy, required capabilities to achieve objectives, and assess conditions for success.

As befitting the eclectic nature of the material, instructors have a wide range of options for use in teaching. They will obviously gear the course toward their particular interests and areas of expertise. It is recommended, however, that readings balance the varying permutations of competition as described in this paper, including not only state and military/intelligence organizations, but also business, social movements, interest groups, and other similar competitors.

A proposed 12-week course syllabus is offered on the following pages.

COMPETITIVE SHAPING IN WORLD POLITICS 12 WEEK COURSE SYLLABUS

Week 1—Power and Competition

- Robert Dahl, “The Concept of Power,” *Behavioral Science*, Volume 2, Issue 3 (1957), 201–215.
- Michael Doyle, “Kant, liberal legacies, and foreign affairs,” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 12, (1983), 205-235.
- G. John Ikenberry, “Liberal Internationalism 3.0: America and the Dilemmas of Liberal World Order,” *Perspectives on Politics* 7, No. 1 (March 2009), 71-87
- Henry Kissinger, *World Order* (New York: Penguin Press, 2014), conclusion.
- Hans Morganthau, *Politics Among Nations* (2005 paperback edition), Chapter 3.
- Nadia Schadlow, “Competitive Engagement: Upgrading America's Influence,” *Orbis* 57, no. 4 (2013), 501-15.
- Thomas Schelling, *Arms and Influence* (New Haven: Yale University Press; Revised edition 2008).

Week 2—Deception, Guile, and Indirect Strategies

- André Beaufre, *An Introduction to Strategy: with particular reference to problems of defence, politics, economics, and diplomacy in the nuclear age*, translated by Major General R.H. Barry (London: Faber and Faber, 1965).
- John Bowyer Bell and Barton Whaley, *Cheating and deception* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1991).
- Lawrence Freedman, *Strategy: A History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013): 3-65.
- Edward N. Luttwak, *The Grand Strategy of the Byzantine Empire* (Boston: Belknap Press, 2011).
- Niccolò Machiavelli, trans. by W.K. Marriott, *The Prince*.
- Sun Tzu, Ralph D. Sawyer, trans., *The Art of War* (New York: Basic Books, 1994).
- Thucydides, *The Landmark Thucydides: A Comprehensive Guide to the Peloponnesian War*, edited by Robert B. Strassler, translated by Richard Crawley, introduction by Victor Davis Hanson (New York: Free Press, 1998).

Week 3—Competitive Strategies

- Bruce Ahlstrand, Joseph Lampel, and Henry Mintzberg, *Strategy Safari: A Guided Tour Through The Wilds of Strategic Management* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2005),
- Thomas Mahnken, ed., *Competitive Strategies for the 21st Century* (Palo Alto, CA: Stanford Security Studies, 2012).
- Michael Porter, *Competitive Strategy* (New York: Free Press, June 1998), introduction.

Week 4—Soft Power, Smart Power, and their Critics

- Martha Bayles, *Through a Screen Darkly: Popular Culture, Public Diplomacy and America's Image Abroad* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2014).
- Eliot A. Cohen, *The Big Stick: The Limits of Soft Power & the Necessity of Military Force* (New York: Basic Books, 2016).
- Niall Ferguson, "Think Again: Power," *Foreign Policy*, November 3, 2009.
- Janice Bially Mattern, "Why 'Soft Power' Isn't So Soft: Representational Force and the Sociolinguistic Construction of Attraction in World Politics," *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 33, No. 3 (2005): 583-612.
- Suzanne Nossel, "Smart Power," *Foreign Affairs*, March/April 2004, 131-142
- Joseph Nye, *Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics* (New York: Public Affairs, New Edition, 2005)
- Joseph Nye, "Get Smart: Combining Soft and Hard Power," *Foreign Affairs*, July/August 2009.

Week 5—Political Warfare and Political Action

- Max Boot and Michael Doran, "Political Warfare," Policy Innovation Memorandum, No. 33, Council on Foreign Relations, June 28, 2013.
- Donovan C. Chau, "Political warfare—an essential instrument of US grand strategy today," *Comparative Strategy* 25, no. 2 (2006): 109-120.
- Patrick James and Glenn E. Mitchell, "Targets of covert pressure: The hidden victims of the democratic peace," *International Interactions* 21, no. 1 (1995): 85-107.
- Brian Michael Jenkins, *Strategy: Political Warfare Neglected* (Santa Monica, CA: Rand Corporation, 26 June 2005).
- William R. Kintner with Joseph Z. Kornfeder, *The New Frontier of War: Political Warfare, Present and Future* (London: Frederick Muller Limited, 1963).
- Linda Robinson, Todd C. Helmus, Raphael S. Cohen, Alireza Nader, Andrew Radin, Madeline Magnuson, and Katya Migacheva, *Modern Political Warfare: Current Practices and Possible Responses* (Santa Monica, CA: Rand Corporation, 2018).
- Paul A. Smith, Jr., *On Political Warfare* (Washington, DC: National Defense University Press, 1989): 3-28.

Week 6—Information Operations, Warfare, and Propaganda

- Richard I. Aldrich, "Putting Culture into the Cold War: The Cultural Relations Department (CRD) and British Covert Information Warfare," *Intelligence & National Security* 18, No. 2 (Summer 2003), 109-133.
- William R. Gery, SeYoung Lee, and Jacob Ninas, "Information Warfare in an Information Age," *JFQ: Joint Force Quarterly* 85, 2nd Quarter (2017), 22-29.
- Carnes Lord, *Losing Hearts and Minds: Public Diplomacy and Strategic Influence in the Age of Terror* (Westport, CT: Praeger Security International, 2006).
- Scot Macdonald, *Propaganda and Information Warfare in the Twenty-First Century: Altered images and deception operations* (New York: Routledge, 2007).
- Ben D. Mor, "Public Diplomacy in Grand Strategy," *Foreign Policy Analysis* 2, No.2 (March 2006), 157-176.
- Jonathan Reed Winkler, "Information Warfare in World War I," *Journal of Military History* 73, No. 3 (July 2009), 845-867.

Week 7—Tools of Competitive Shaping

- Robert D. Blackwell and Jennifer M. Harris, *War by Other Means: Geoeconomics and Statecraft* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press, 2016).
- Rosa Brooks, *How Everything Became War and the Military Became Everything: Tales from the Pentagon* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2016).
- John J. Carter, *Covert operations as a tool of presidential foreign policy in American history from 1800 to 1920: Foreign policy in the shadows* (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2000).
- Chas. W. Freeman, Jr., *Arts of Power: Statecraft and Diplomacy* (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace, 1997).
- Roy Godson, *Dirty Tricks or Trump Cards: U.S. Covert Action & Counterintelligence* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1995; 2008 edition): 134-158.
- Rufus Phillips, *Breathing Life Into Expeditionary Diplomacy: A Missing Dimension of US Security Capabilities* (Bethesda, MD: National Strategy Information Center, Fall 2014).
- Nadia Schadlow, *Organizing to compete in the political terrain* (Carlisle Barracks, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, 2010).

Week 8—The Contemporary Security Environment

- Braden R. Allenby, “The paradox of dominance: The age of civilizational conflict.” *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 71 (March, 2015).
- Hal Brands, “Paradoxes of the Gray Zone,” *FPRI E-Notes*, February 5, 2016.
- James Callard and Peter Faber, “An Emerging Synthesis for a New Way of War: Combinational Warfare and Future Innovation,” *Georgetown Journal of International Affairs* 3, No. 1 (Winter/Spring 2002): 61-68.
- Kelly M. Greenhill, *Whispers of War, Mongers of Fear: Extra-factual Sources of Threat Conception and Proliferation*, forthcoming.
- Frank G. Hoffman, “Hybrid Threats: Reconceptualizing the Evolving Character of Modern Conflict,” *Strategic Forum*, No. 240, April 2009.
- “Hybrid Warfare: Challenge and Response,” *Military Balance* (London: Institute for International Strategic Studies, 2015): 17–20.
- Michael Mazarr, *Mastering the Gray Zone* (Carlisle, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, 2015).
- Martin Van Creveld, *The Transformation of War* (New York: The Free Press, 1991).

Week 9—Historical Case Study: The US and the Early Cold War

- Sarah-Jane Corke, *US Covert Operations and Cold War Strategy: Truman, Secret Warfare and the CIA, 1945-53* (London: Routledge, 2007).
- John Lewis Gaddis, *Strategies of containment: a critical appraisal of American national security policy during the Cold War* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005).
- Scott Lucas and Kaeten Mistry, “Illusions of coherence: George F. Kennan, US strategy and political warfare in the early Cold War, 1946–1950,” *Diplomatic History* 33, no. 1 (2009): 39-66.
- Kaeten Mistry, “The case for political warfare: Strategy, organization and US involvement in the 1948 Italian election,” *Cold War History* 6, no. 3 (2006): 301-329.
- Kaeten Mistry, *The United States, Italy and the Origins of Cold War: Waging Political Warfare, 1945–1950* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014).
- John Prados, *Safe for democracy: The secret wars of the CIA* (New York: Rowman & Littlefield, 2006).

- Paul A. Smith, Jr., *On Political Warfare* (Washington, DC: National Defense University Press, 1989): 185-211.

Week 10—Case Study: Russia

- Keir Giles, *Russia's 'New' Tools for Confronting the West: Continuity and Innovation in Moscow's Exercise of Power*. Chatham House Research Paper (March, 2016).
- Jolanta Darczewska, "The Anatomy of Russian Information Warfare, The Crimean Operation," *Point of View*, Warsaw: Centre for Eastern Studies, May 2014.
- Zane M. Galvach, Anton V Soltis, Thomas B. Everett, Matthew J Mesko, and Jeffrey V. Dickey, *Russian political warfare: origin, evolution, and application*. Master's Thesis, Monterey, California: Naval Postgraduate School, 2015.
- Emilio J. Iasiello, "Russia's Improved Information Operations: From Georgia to Crimea," *Parameters* 47, No. 2 (Summer 2017), 51-63.
- Martin Kragh and Sebastian Asberg, "Russia's Strategy for Influence through Public Diplomacy and Active Measures: The Swedish Case," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 40, no. 6 (January 5, 2017): 773-816.
- Mark Kramer, "The Soviet Roots of Meddling in U.S. Politics," *PONARS Eurasia Policy Memo # 452*, Washington, DC, January, 2017, at <http://www.ponarseurasia.org/memo/soviet-roots-meddling-us-politics>.
- Timothy Thomas, "Russia's Information Warfare Strategy: Can the Nation Cope in Future Conflicts?," *Journal of Slavic Military Studies* 27, No. 1 (January-March 2014), 101-130.
- Clint Watts, *Messing with the Enemy: Surviving in a Social Media World of Hackers, Terrorists, Russians, and Fake News* (New York: Harper Collins, 2018).

Week 11—Case Study: China

- Dean Cheng, "Winning Without Fighting: Chinese Psychological Warfare," The Heritage Foundation, July 12, 2013.
- Peter Dutton, "Three Disputes and Three Objectives," *Naval War College Review* 64, No. 4 (Autumn 2011), 42-67.
- Stefan Halper, China: The Three Warfares, Section VIII, Paper 1, Peter Mattis, "Chinese Propaganda and Positioning in the Sino-American Crises," <http://cryptome.org/2014/06/prc-three-wars.pdf>
- "Lawfare, the Latest Asymmetries," Council on Foreign Relations, summary of FY03 National Security Roundtable, sixth session, March 18, 2003, <http://www.cfr.org/national-security-and-defense/lawfare-latest-asymmetries/p5772> (accessed April 28, 2012).
- Li Mingjiang, "China Debates Soft Power," *The Chinese Journal of International Politics*, Volume 2, Issue 2, 1 December 2008, Pages 287-308.
- Mark Stokes and Russell Hsiao, *The People's Liberation Army's General Political Department, Political Warfare with Chinese Characteristics*, Project 2049 Institute, September 14, 2013.
- Tim Walton, "China's Three Warfares," Delex Systems, January 18, 2012.

Week 12—Case Study: al-Qaeda and the Islamic State

- Cole Bunzel, *From Paper State to Caliphate: The Ideology of the Islamic State* (Washington DC: Brookings Institution, 2015).
- Shireen K. Burki, "Ceding the Ideological Battlefield to Al Qaeda: The Absence of an Effective U.S. Information Warfare Strategy," *Comparative Strategy* 28, No. 4 (September/October 2009), 349-366.
- Daniel L. Byman and Jennifer R. Williams, "ISIS vs. Al Qaeda: Jihadism's global civil war," Brookings Institution, February 24, 2015.
- Tore Refslund Hamming, "Jihadi Competition and Political Preferences," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 11, No 6 (2017).
- _____, "The Al Qaeda-Islamic State Rivalry: Competition Yes, but No Competitive Escalation," *Terrorism and Political Violence* 7, No. 11 (2017): 1-18.
- Bruce Hoffman, "Return of the Jihadi," *The National Interest* 141 (January/February 2016), 9-17.
- Gilles Kepel, *Jihad: The Trail of Political Islam*, translated by Anthony F. Roberts (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004), chapters 2, 6, 9, 13.
- William McCants, *The ISIS Apocalypse: The History, Strategy, and Doomsday Vision of the Islamic State* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2015).
- Barak Mendelsohn, "Al Qaeda's Franchising Strategy," *Survival* 53, No. 3 (May-June, 2011), pp. 29-50.
- Kenneth Payne, "Winning the Battle of Ideas: Propaganda, Ideology, and Terror," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 32, No. 2 (February 2009), 109-128.

NOTES



FOREIGN POLICY RESEARCH INSTITUTE

The Foreign Policy Research Institute is a non-partisan, non-profit 501 (c)(3) organization dedicated to bringing the insights of scholarship to bear on the foreign policy and national security challenges facing the United States. It seeks to educate the public, teach teachers, train students, and offer ideas to advance U.S. national interests based on a non-partisan, geopolitical perspective that illuminates contemporary international affairs through the lens of history, geography, and culture.

Foreign Policy Research Institute

1528 Walnut Street, Suite 610
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-732-3774 www.fpri.org